

CHARLES A. BONNER, ESQ. SB# 85413
A. CABRAL BONNER, ESQ. SB# 247528
LAW OFFICES OF BONNER & BONNER
475 GATE FIVE RD, SUITE 211
SAUSALITO, CA 94965
TEL: (415) 331-3070
FAX: (415) 331-2738
cbonner799@aol.com
cabral@bonnerlaw.com

JEFFREY L. MENDELMAN, ESQ. SB# 305629
CASE LAW LTD.
580 CALIFORNIA STREET, Fl. 12
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104
TEL: (833) 227-3583
FAX: (415) 520-5405
admin@caselawltd.com

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
UNLIMITED JURISDICTION**

**JEFFREY ROSENBLOOM; and JESSE
ROSENBLOOM,**
Plaintiffs,

vs.

**HAWAIIAN AIRLINES INC., and DOES 1-
50,**

Defendants.

Case No.: 3:21-CV-02411

RELATED CASE 4:20-CV-07583-SBA

COMPLAINT FOR DAMAGES

1. COMMON CARRIER NEGLIGENCE (CIVIL CODE § 2100)
2. NEGLIGENCE
3. NEGLIGENCE PER SE
4. NEGLIGENCE RES IPSA LOQUITUR
5. INTENTIONAL INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS
6. PRIVATE ATTORNEY GENERAL FEES

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

INTRODUCTION

1. On August 22, 2019, DEFENDANT HAWAIIAN AIR negligently failed to repair, maintain, service and inspect its Jet Engines on its Flight 47 from Oakland, California to Honolulu,

1 Hawaii, Daniel K. Inouye International Airport, causing smoke-filled Hawaiian Airlines flight to
2 make an emergency landing, injuring Plaintiffs and causing several passengers to be hospitalized.
3 The flight landed just before 11:40 a.m. local time and the crew immediately deployed all eight
4 emergency slides so passengers could quickly evacuate.

5 2. DEFENDANT HAWAIIAN AIR admits it is liable for damages that "...are proven to have
6 been caused by Hawaiian's sole negligence or willful misconduct and you have not been
7 contributorily negligent." (Hawaiian Air website)¹

8 3. A spokesperson for DEFENDANT HAWAIIAN AIR, Alex Da Silva, said in an emailed
9 statement: "We have since determined that a seal failed in the aircraft's left engine, causing oil to
10 leak onto hot parts of the plane's engine and air conditioning pressurization system, resulting in
11 smoke in the cabin,"² Jon Snook, the carrier's chief operations officer, said "the pilot didn't drop
12 oxygen masks for passengers because oxygen would have fed the flames if there'd been a fire on
13 board."³ Plaintiffs were passengers and suffered severe and extreme physical, mental and
14 emotional distress from choking on engine smoke for a period of more than thirty (30) minutes of
15 an altitude of more than 36,000 feet.

16 4. Jet engine smoke is comprised of aromatics hydrocarbons including, but not limited to, the
17 following: Aviation fuels consist of blends of over two thousand chemicals, primarily
18 hydrocarbons (paraffins, olefins, naphthenes, and aromatics), additives such as antioxidants and
19 metal deactivators, biocides, static reducers, icing inhibitors, corrosion inhibitors, and impurities.
20 Principal components include n-heptane and isooctane. Like other fuels, aviation fuels for spark-
21 ignited piston engines are described by their octane rating.

22 5. Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) are a group of over 100 different chemicals that
23 are formed during the incomplete burning of coal, oil and gas, garbage, or other organic substances
24 like tobacco or charbroiled meat. PAHs are usually found as a mixture containing two or more of
25 these compounds, such as soot.

26 ¹ <https://www.hawaiianairlines.com/legal/domestic-contract-of-carriage/rule-20>

27 ² [file:///C:/Users/calbo/Downloads/Hawaiian%20Air %20Engine%20problem%20caused%20smoke%20to%20fill%20plane.%20forcing%20emergency%20landing.pdf](file:///C:/Users/calbo/Downloads/Hawaiian%20Air%20Engine%20problem%20caused%20smoke%20to%20fill%20plane.%20forcing%20emergency%20landing.pdf)

28 ³ <https://www.cnn.com/2019/08/22/us/hawaiian-airlines-smoke-injuries/index.html>

1 6. Alcohol, alcohol mixtures, and other alternative fuels may be used experimentally, but
2 alcohol is not permitted in any certified aviation fuel specification. “Cancer Classification: EPA:
3 Confirmed human carcinogen...Reasonably anticipated to be a human carcinogen.”⁴

4 7. Jet fuel is a mixture of a variety of hydrocarbons. A hydrocarbon is an organic compound
5 consisting entirely of hydrogen and carbon. Most hydrocarbons found on Earth naturally occur in
6 petroleum. Petroleum is a naturally occurring, yellowish-black liquid found in geological
7 formations beneath the Earth's surface. It is commonly refined into various types of fuels.⁵

8 8. A video taken on board the flight shows frightened passengers covering their mouths with
9 clothing as a crew member makes an announcement. Plaintiffs were terrified during the thirty (30)
10 minutes of flight marinating in the engine smoked filled cabin without any oxygen or explanation
11 regarding the cause, source, or nature of the smoke. Plaintiffs’ minds were branded with the fear
12 that a terrorist’s bomb was on board, causing the smoke and they were going to die. All Plaintiffs
13 have been diagnosed with severe Post Traumatic Distress Disorder (“PTSD”).

14 **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

15 9. This Court has jurisdiction over this lawsuit pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a)(1) as the
16 matter in controversy exceeds the sum or value of \$75,000, exclusive of interest and costs, and is
17 between citizens of different States. PLAINTIFFS bring this action pursuant to the laws of the
18 State of California. Venue is proper in this judicial district because PLAINTIFFS’ injuries,
19 damages and harm occurred here pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b)(2). In addition, DEFENDANT
20 HAWAIIAN AIRLINES removed the related case, 4:20-CV-07583-SBA, from state court to this
21 federal district court. Further, one or more of the DEFENDANTS conduct business in this judicial
22 district. Defendant maintains one of its several hubs as well as one of its largest maintenance
23 centers at Oakland International Airport (“OAK”) within this District, leases commercial space at
24 OAK from the City of Oakland and County of Alameda, acting by and through its Airport
25 Commission, operates daily scheduled flights to and from OAK, employs thousands of employees
26 in and around OAK, and regularly solicits business from the citizens of this District. This action

26 ⁴ The Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR), based in Atlanta, Georgia, is a
27 federal public health agency of the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services.

28 ⁵ <https://www.atsdr.cdc.gov/substances/toxsubstance.asp?toxid=25>

⁵ <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Petroleum>

1 concerns injuries that Plaintiffs suffered while passengers on a flight operated by Defendant, which
2 was part of a ticketed itinerary that departed from and returned to OAK.

3 **PARTIES**

4 10. Plaintiffs JEFFREY Rosenbloom; his adult son Jesse Rosenbloom, are and were at all
5 relevant times individuals, and residents of Alameda County, California.

6 11. Defendant Hawaiian Airlines Inc. (“HAI”) is a corporate citizen of the State of Hawaii
7 where it maintains its principal business offices. Defendant operates an airline that makes
8 regularly scheduled flights between Hubs in California and numerous domestic and international
9 airports.

10 **DOE DEFENDANTS**

11 12. Defendant Does 1 through 50 inclusive, are sued herein under the provisions of the Code
12 of Civil Procedure § 474, of the State of California, and upon the ascertainment by Plaintiffs of
13 said Defendants’ true identity, Plaintiffs will amend to state their true identity. Plaintiffs are
14 informed and believe and therein allege that each of the defendants designated herein by a fictitious
15 name is in some way negligent or responsible for the events and happenings herein referred to
16 which proximately resulted in those injuries and damages to the Plaintiffs as herein alleged.

17 **STATEMENT OF FACTS**

18 13. On August 22, 2019, Plaintiffs were fare-paying passengers aboard Hawaiian Airlines
19 flight 47 from Oakland, California with an intended destination of Honolulu, Hawaii.

20 14. At all times mentioned herein, HAWAIIAN Airlines, Inc. was a common carrier engaged
21 in the business of transporting passengers for hire by air.

22 15. Hawaiian Airlines, Flight 47 from Oakland, California, was forced to make an emergency
23 landing in Honolulu, about 20 minutes before a scheduled destination of Honolulu, Hawaii, when
24 the cabin and cargo hold filled with smoke from a failed seal in the aircraft’s left engine, causing
25 oil to leak onto hot parts of the plane’s engine and air conditioning pressurization system, resulting
26 in smoke in the cabin,

27 16. Smoke began filling the cabin and at no time were the passengers instructed how to prepare
28 for the emergency landing, which caused Plaintiffs’ anxiety levels to immediately increase even
more, and passengers surrounding the Plaintiffs to hyperventilate, causing panic among the
passengers and Plaintiffs.

1 17. At that point, Plaintiffs became utterly fearful for their lives, and began to think they may
2 not survive. Plaintiffs grasped desperately at the seat in front of them. Plaintiff mothers became
3 terrified, grabbing their children's hand believing they might die.

4 18. Upon landing, they were further terrified when they heard airline personnel instructing
5 them to slide down a shoot because they were uncertain if the plane was about to explode. Plaintiffs
6 and other passengers were screaming, crying and panicking as they were deplaning the aircraft.
7 As a result of the foregoing, Plaintiffs suffered physical and traumatic mental and emotional
8 injuries.

8 DAMAGES

9 19. The Rosenbloom Family: Jeffrey and Jesse: The Rosenblooms embarked on a planned
10 family trip to Kauai by way of Oahu aboard Flight 47 when smoke began to fill the cabin, while
11 the plane was still over water. The smoke was very thick and smelled like a mix of oil and gas.
12 Flight attendants started walking through the cabin asking if anyone knew where the smoke was
13 coming from. Within two minutes, flight attendants came on and instructed passengers to cover
14 our mouths with a cloth and sit as low as possible in the seat. No explanation was given as to why
15 oxygen masks were not dropped as shown in the safety video before takeoff.

16 20. The aircraft dropped altitude rapidly with heavy turbulence. We were told to assume
17 emergency positions. This included putting one's head on one's lap and covering one's neck with
18 one's hands. This position was absolutely impossible in the coach section where Plaintiffs sat since
19 the airline had placed the seats so closely together. The impossibility of getting into the safe crash
20 position added to the stress and chaos in the cabin. Passengers were told we were going to be
21 landing at a very high speed and should prepare for a very rough entry. Upon landing, which
22 occurred about 30 minutes after the smoke filled the cabin, the captain announced that passengers
23 should abandon the airline via the emergency slides.

24 21. After the emergency evacuation, Plaintiffs were left on the tarmac with no information
25 provided by HAI. Approximately 30 minutes later, Plaintiffs were bussed to a terminal, where they
26 were kept for at least 2 hours until their belongings were retrieved. No explanation was provided
27 as to why this process took so long. Jeffrey was meeting the rest of his family in the airport for
28 another inter-island flight and kept telling HAI representatives to hold the connecting flight to
Kauai for them to no avail. No calls were made by HAI to hold the connecting flight. Jesse heard
that the possibility of terrorism was being investigated by the FBI. The Rosenblooms then literally

1 had to run with all of their luggage to the connecting flight's terminal. Once there, Jeffrey had to
2 plead with the HAI representative to be allowed to board the connecting flight. HAI knew about
3 the Rosenbloom's experience, but did nothing to help them.

4 22. The remainder of the Rosenbloom's vacation, August 23-27, 2019 was ruined. Jeffrey was
5 traumatized and found he could not breathe properly, causing him to not be able to run or swim,
6 despite being a high performing, masters-level athlete prior to Flight 47. Severe anxiety set in for
7 Jesse. On the trip, he could not spend long periods of time in a car without panicking and feeling
8 trapped. He was unable to scuba dive as planned or go on a boat due to the anxiety he was
9 experiencing. He could not sleep and was battling the fear of having to board the return flight home
10 in less than a week.

11 23. On August 29, 2019, Jesse sought out a psychiatric evaluation to diagnose his mental health
12 condition that had rapidly developed. He was diagnosed with PTSD and Acute Stress disorder.

13 24. Jeffrey's breathing did not return to normal over the months that followed. He sought
14 medical treatment and received a battery of tests at the direction of a pulmonologist. He was
15 prescribed steroids and a reduced activity regime, which was difficult to accept. Jeffrey was not
16 able to work at full capacity nor return to anything resembling his normal exercise routine.

17 25. In December 2019, while traveling in Salt Lake City, Utah, Jeffrey began coughing up
18 blood. He went to urgent care and was immediately ordered to and admitted to the emergency
19 department. He received more tests. The bleeding abated and he was able to travel back home,
20 where he received more care and tests. The tests revealed that he had a deep lung infection that
21 had been festering since the smoke inhalation on Flight 47. Since December 2019, Jeffrey has been
22 prescribed steroids and has never fully regained his same level of fitness, which has greatly reduced
23 his quality of life.

24 26. September 16, 2020 was the first time Jesse was able to get on a flight since Flight 47. He
25 traveled to Denver to visit his brother and sister-in-law. Upon take-off, he immediately
26 experienced a panic attack. He was unable to breathe and overcome by panic and fear. Jesse
27 continues to seek psychiatric help for his mental state.

28 27. HAI told passengers including Plaintiffs that Flight 47 would be paid for as well as
additional flight compensation provided. This was FALSE.

28 28. Jesse and Jeffrey have each been damaged in expensive medical bills. Jesse has had to pay
for psychiatric consultations, as well as acupuncture appointments to deal with insomnia and stress.

1 Jesse has been unable to take public transportation due to the panic of the train running
2 underground and has had to come out of pocket for parking, gas, and tolls.

3 29. Jesse has experienced headaches, neck pain, and insomnia. He experiences nocturnal panic
4 attacks and night terrors. Prior to Flight 47, Jesse never had been experienced any mental distress.
5 Jesse lost motivation to work and lost enjoyment in his prior hobbies, including avoiding activities
6 he thought could trigger a panic attack. Jesse became irritable and introverted and not his typical
7 easy-going, enjoyable self as he was prior to Flight 47. These changes caused turmoil in his
8 relationships. He continues to have a strong fear of flying and has avoided going on trips to visit
9 family and friends. He has become afraid of being confined in elevators or underground subways.
10 He has been diagnosed with generalized anxiety disorder. His inability to visit his friends and
11 family, and enjoy his life has caused him moderate depression. To accommodate his fear of public
12 transit, Jesse would work remotely (before this became the norm during the pandemic) and it was
13 viewed by his management at work as a lack of engagement.

14 **FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION**
15 **(BY ALL PLAINTIFFS)**
16 **COMMON CARRIER NEGLIGENCE**
17 **(California Code, Civil Code § 2100)**
18 **Against Hawaiian Airlines Inc.**

19 30. Plaintiffs incorporate by reference the prior paragraphs of this complaint as though set forth
20 in full.

21 31. California Civil Code Sections 2168-2178 provides, in pertinent part: “Everyone who
22 offers to the public to carry persons, property, or messages, excepting only telegraphic messages,
23 is a common carrier of whatever he thus offers to carry.” California Code, Civil Code § 2100
24 states: “A carrier of persons for reward must use the utmost care and diligence for their safe
25 carriage, must provide everything necessary for that purpose, and must exercise to that end a
26 reasonable degree of skill.”

27 32. Defendant HAWAIIAN AIRLINES at all times herein owed a duty to Plaintiffs, passengers
28 for reward, to exercise, with at least a reasonable degree of skill, the utmost care and diligence in
delivering them to their destination. As a “common carrier” Defendant HAWAIIAN AIRLINES
breached the duty owing to Plaintiffs and is therefore negligent and liable to Plaintiffs for all
economic and non-economic damages, including all pain, mental and emotional distress, loss of
enjoyment of life, anxiety, fear, PTSD and misery.

1 33. The carcinogenic jet engine smoke and subsequent emergency landing were caused or
2 contributed by the negligence of Hawaiian Airlines, and each of them, their officers, agents,
3 servants and/or employees in that they were careless in, among other ways, the operation, control,
4 maintenance, repair, service, and/or inspection of the subject aircraft.

5 34. As a direct and proximate result of the negligence of Hawaiian Airlines, Plaintiffs sustained
6 physical and emotional injuries, incurred medical expenses and will continue to incur medical
7 expenses for medical care and treatment, suffered and will continue to suffer physical pain,
8 emotional stress, loss of enjoyment of life and other permanent compensable injuries all with
9 resulting damages.

10 35. By reason of the foregoing, Hawaiian Airlines is liable to Plaintiffs for compensatory
11 damages in a sum to be determined at trial.

12 36. The carcinogenic jet engine smoke and subsequent traumatic emergency landing and
13 resulting injuries were caused by the wanton and willful misconduct of the Hawaiian Airlines
14 Airline Defendants, and each of them, including its officers, agents, servants and employees as set
15 forth herein, whose actions and omissions were outrageous and gross and said defendants acted
16 with reckless and conscious disregard for the safety of Plaintiffs. Among other things, Hawaiian
17 Airlines knew, or should have known, that the aircraft was not safely and carefully maintained,
18 repaired, serviced, inspected, or handled.

19 37. WHEREFORE, Plaintiffs pray for relief as set forth herein.

20 **SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION**
21 **(BY ALL PLAINTIFFS)**
22 **NEGLIGENCE**
23 **Against Hawaiian Airlines Inc.**

24 38. Plaintiffs repeat, reiterate and re-allege each and every allegation contained in this
25 complaint as though fully set forth herein.

26 39. The carcinogenic smoke and subsequent emergency landing were caused or contributed
27 by the negligence of Hawaiian Airlines, and each of them, their officers, agents, servants and/or
28 employees in that they were careless in, among other ways, the operation, control, maintenance,
repair, service, and/or inspection of the subject aircraft.

40. As a direct and proximate result of the negligence of Hawaiian Airlines, Plaintiffs sustained
physical and emotional injuries, incurred medical expenses and will continue to incur medical
expenses for medical care and treatment, suffered and will continue to suffer physical pain,

1 emotional stress, loss of enjoyment of life and other permanent compensable injuries all with
2 resulting damages.

3 41. By reason of the foregoing, Hawaiian Airlines is liable to Plaintiffs for compensatory
4 damages in a sum to be determined at trial.

5 42. The carcinogenic jet engine smoke and subsequent traumatic emergency landing and
6 resulting injuries were caused by the wanton and willful misconduct of the Hawaiian Airlines
7 Airline Defendants, and each of them, including its officers, agents, servants and employees as set
8 forth herein, whose actions and omissions were outrageous and gross and said defendants acted
9 with reckless and conscious disregard for the safety of Plaintiffs. Among other things, Hawaiian
10 Airlines knew, or should have known, that the aircraft was not safely and carefully maintained,
11 repaired, serviced, inspected, or handled. Plaintiffs must now monitor their health for the rest of
12 their lives because inhalation of carcinogenic oil engine smoke for over 30 minutes can cause
13 cancer and genetic mutations for many years in the future and to off springs.

14 43. WHEREFORE, Plaintiff prays for relief as set forth herein.

15 **THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION**
16 **(BY ALL PLAINTIFFS)**
17 **NEGLIGENCE PER SE**
18 **Against Hawaiian Airlines Inc.**

19 44. Plaintiffs incorporate by reference the prior paragraphs of this complaint as though set forth
20 in full.

21 45. Defendants Hawaiian Airline violated safety rules and regulations promulgated by the
22 Federal Aviation Authority (“FAA”) regarding care, inspection, repair and maintenance of
23 engines, including, oil seals on jet engines.

24 46. Defendants Hawaiian Airline violated, *inter alia*, 14 CFR § 5.71 - Safety performance
25 monitoring and measurement by failing to conduct timely safety inspections of the engine seals to
26 as to prevent the near tragedy that could have been caused by leaking flammable oil on to a hot jet
27 engine. The FAA safety rules and regulations are enacted to protect passengers such as Plaintiffs
28 herein. Defendants Hawaiian Airline violated 14 CFR Subpart J pertaining to “Special
Airworthiness Requirements.” Clearly, an oil leaking engine seal on to a hot jet engine renders the
Air Bus A330 is a negligent failure of the Airworthiness Requirement under the rules and
regulations of the FAA.

1 47. The carcinogenic jet engine smoke and subsequent traumatic emergency landing and
2 resulting injuries were caused by the wanton and willful misconduct of the Hawaiian Airlines
3 Airline Defendants, and each of them, including its officers, agents, servants and employees as set
4 forth herein, whose actions and omissions were outrageous and gross and said defendants acted
5 with reckless and conscious disregard for the safety of Plaintiffs. Among other things, Hawaiian
6 Airlines knew, or should have known, that the aircraft was not safely and carefully maintained,
7 repaired, serviced, inspected, or handled. Defendants Hawaiian Airline’s violation of The FAA
8 safety rules and regulations enacted to protect passengers such as Plaintiffs is negligence per se.

8 48. WHEREFORE, Plaintiff prays for relief as set forth herein.

9 **FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION**
10 **(BY ALL PLAINTIFFS)**
11 **NEGLIGENCE RES IPSA LOQUITUR**
12 **Against Hawaiian Airlines Inc.**

12 49. Plaintiff incorporates by reference the prior paragraphs of this complaint as though set forth
13 in full.

14 50. Defendant HAWAIIAN AIRLINES at all times herein owed a duty to Plaintiffs, passengers
15 for reward, to exercise, with at least a reasonable degree of skill, the utmost care and diligence in
16 delivering them to their destination. As a “common carrier” Defendant HAWAIIAN AIRLINES
17 breached the duty owing to Plaintiffs and is therefore negligent and liable to Plaintiffs for all
18 economic and non-economic damages, including all pain, mental and emotional distress, loss of
19 enjoyment of life, anxiety, fear, PTSD and misery.

20 51. Defendant HAWAIIAN AIRLINES negligence is the type of recklessness that does not
21 happen in the absence of someone’s negligence. Millions of airplanes fly every day, 24/7 without
22 defective engine seals leaking flammable oil on the jet engine, causing the cabin to fill with
23 carcinogenic smoke, resulting in a subsequent traumatic emergency landing. Plaintiffs passengers
24 were not in any way negligent and the instrumentality causing injury was in the exclusive control
25 of DEFENDANT HAWAIIAN AIRLINE. Hence, DEFENDANT’S the doctrine of *Res Ipsa*
26 *Loquitur*, “the negligence speaks of itself” is applicable to prove DEFENDANT HAWAIIAN
27 AIRLINES’ negligence. Among other things, Hawaiian Airlines knew, or should have known, that
28 the aircraft was not safely and carefully maintained, repaired, serviced, inspected, or handled.

52. WHEREFORE, Plaintiff prays for relief as set forth herein.

FIFTH CAUSE OF ACTION
(BY ALL PLAINTIFFS)
INTENTIONAL INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS
Against Hawaiian Airlines Inc.

53. Plaintiff incorporates by reference the prior paragraphs of this complaint as though set forth in full.

54. Defendant HAWAIIAN AIRLINES Hawaiian Airlines knew, or should have known, that the aircraft was not safely and carefully maintained, repaired, serviced, inspected, or handled. DEFENDANT HAWAIIAN AIRLINES engaged in extreme and outrageous conduct with it intentionally failed to properly inspect, repair, service, inspect and maintain it engine seal. Defendant HAWAIIAN AIRLINES placed profit before safety in violations of the FAA safety rules and regulations. Defendant HAWAIIAN AIRLINES's reckless, intentional and outrageous conduct should not be and is not tolerated in our civilized society which depends and rely on common carriers place the passengers' safety first, above all money-saving measure employed to increase profits.

55. The carcinogenic jet engine smoke and subsequent traumatic emergency landing and resulting injuries were caused by the intentional, wanton, reckless and willful misconduct of the Defendants Hawaiian Airlines Airline, and each of them, including its officers, agents, servants and employees as set forth herein, whose actions and omissions were outrageous and gross and said defendants acted with reckless and conscious disregard for the safety of Plaintiffs. Defendants Hawaiian Airlines Airline acted with malice, fraud and oppression, causing severe mental and emotional distress in Plaintiffs.

56. WHEREFORE, Plaintiff prays for relief as set forth herein.

SIXTH CAUSE OF ACTION
(BY ALL PLAINTIFFS)
PRIVATE ATTORNEY GENERAL ALLEGATIONS
Against all Defendants

57. Plaintiffs bring these claims as private attorneys general and the general public pursuant to Business & Professions Code § 17204. **This Code provides in pertinent part: "Actions for relief pursuant to this chapter shall be prosecuted ...by a person who has suffered injury in fact and has lost money or property as a result of the unfair competition."** Plaintiffs seek to enjoin Defendants from engaging in the unfair and fraudulent business practices alleged, and to require

1 Defendants to make restitution of all monies wrongfully obtained through their unfair and
2 fraudulent business practices. A private attorney general/representative action is necessary and
3 appropriate because Defendants have engaged in the wrongful acts alleged as a general business
4 practice.

5 **PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

6 Plaintiff respectfully prays for relief as follows:

- 7 1. For a money judgment for emotional distress, pain, suffering and other general
8 damages according to proof with pre- judgment and post-judgment interest thereon;
- 9 2. For a money judgment representing compensatory special and economic damages
10 --together with interest on these amounts-- according to proof with the prejudgment
11 interest thereon, including, but not limited to: medical expenses, out of pocket
12 expenses, other incidental and consequential expenses; wage losses; damage to
13 personal property; all according to proof at trial;
- 14 3. For attorneys' fees pursuant and all costs of suit incurred herein; and
- 15 4. For Punitive damages in the amount of \$12,000,000 to protect the safety of society.
- 16 5. All other and further relief as the court deems just and proper.

17 Dated: April 2, 2021

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,
LAW OFFICES OF BONNER & BONNER

19 /s/Charles A. Bonner
20 Charles A. Bonner
21 Attorney for Plaintiffs

22 CASE LAW LTD.
23 /s/ Jeffrey Mendelman
24 Attorney for Plaintiffs